

Arlington Historic District Commissions

March 27, 2014
Whittemore Robbins House

Final and Approved

Commissioners Present: D. Baldwin, C. Barry, M. Bush, B. Cohen, J. Cummings, C. Hamilton, S. Makowka, J. Nyberg, M. Penzenik (arrived at 8:17pm), J. Worden

Commissioners Absent: J. Black, M. Logan

Guests: H. Belofsky, K. Connelly, D. Schaefer, T. Cain, S Walsh, M. Walsh, N. Mishkin, J. Mishkin

1. AHDC Meeting Opens 8:00pm
2. Appointment of alternate Commissioners; Mt. Gilboa/Crescent Hill – J. Nyberg, C. Barry, B. Cohen, C. Hamilton, J. Cummings; Russell Street: J. Nyberg recused himself for 39 Russell Street Hearing. C. Barry, M. Bush, B. Cohen, C. Hamilton, J. Cummings will participate but not vote.
3. Approval of draft minutes from February 27, 2014. J. Worden moved approval. C. Barry seconded. Unanimous approval
4. Communications
 - a. Email re: Preservation Loan Program information request
 - b. CONA Application for 21 Oak Knoll (Donal) for side entry door
 - c. Call re: Demolition Sign Off (Gave AHC contact info)
 - d. Call re: Historic District Website Questions
 - e. CONA Application for Jason Street (Bouvier)
 - f. Request for minutes on website – updates made
 - g. J. Worden reported Preservation Fund received communication on Academy Street project
 - h. Discussion about supporting Town Meeting approval of Community Preservation Act. J. Worden moved approval of AHDC taking vote to support Town Meeting's approval of adoption of Community Preservation Act. Seconded by C. Barry for discussion. Group felt we should support. Unanimous approval
 - i. J. Worden showed old HD maps which can be included in the Town By-laws. C. Greeley to ask GIS folks to work on updating maps.
5. New Business
 - Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application) 8:20pm
 - a. Formal Hearing re: 50 Westmoreland Ave. (Sessa) re: installation of solar panels.

Contractor appeared on behalf of the homeowner. Applicant is looking to install solar panels on front of house. M. Bush, who is familiar with the property, noted that it's a modern ('60s), garrison ranch-style infill house that is set a little back from street. The slope of the street is steep at that point and the house faces due south. The Commission discussed the appropriateness of having solar panels front and center. M. Bush said this particular site is up a hill and in his mind you're probably not going to ruin the district by changing this modern brown shingled roof to be a glass panel roof. S. Makowka said a very visible installation on a front façade that detracts from a historically significant property would bother him, but this is a case where the placement of the house on a steep hill, and the building is a non-contributing structure, he has less problem with granting permission. Installer said in Salem and Swampscott HC is allowing solar panels in their districts (did not say they were front façade of homes). M. Penzenik noted that there aren't any vent stacks or a chimney, thus allowing for a straight line of panels which she finds less offensive than a choppy pattern and she doesn't mind it. J. Worden asked why they didn't submit their application with pictures of before and after conditions as requested on the application? He is concerned that the Commissioners are being asked to approve something without knowing what it will look like when finished. S. Makowka suggested that the hearing be continued to the meeting on 4/17 to allow the applicant to supplement the application. He noted that the Commission discourages dark panels with silver edging. He also asked that they indicate where the wiring is going to go – the conduit should be placed to be the least visible as possible. M. Penzenik said she wanted to clarify whether they have a panel in black and the contractor said yes. Also, the conduit can be painted to minimize visual impact. C. Greeley will email a recently approved solar application as guide per Applicant's request).

- b. **Formal Hearing re: 39 Russell Street (Walsh)** re: addition of new structure and refurbishment of existing structure.

T. Cain from Revivals in Arlington gave presentation. Site Plan – top sheet. At bottom you see 39 Russell St on left and the neighboring structure on the right to get a comparison of two homes together. Proposed square footage and existing square footage shown for comparison. He indicated that the FAR of 1.7 is approximately half the allowable under zoning in the district. J. Worden asked about the average coverage compared to other lots in the district. T. Cain stated that he did not have this information but that this is the largest lot in the district even with the proposed addition it likely would have the largest open space in the district. S. Makowka said one of the issues addressed by the Commission is the appropriateness of the massing and the size of the proposed structure relative to the available space on the lot – a key question is how does this proposal compare with other lots in the district? S. Makowka noted that the proposed new structure is sited pretty much behind the other existing structure so as to minimize the visual impact from the street. T. Cain continued, the next sheet: A1 – First floor shown in plan and exterior walkway to new entry also between existing house and existing garage as well. M. Bush said at least in principle this is one structure and yet the connecting 'breezeway' is labeled as a laundry which doesn't connect in any way to the original building. T. Cain continued: Sheet A3 - at top of sheet you see house from what is the Water Street side and the bottom depiction is the proposed house from the back. S. Makowka asked for clarification of the comment under the heading "general notes" indicating that the existing home was to be patched and painted to match existing structures. T. Cain indicated that an additional intention of the owners is for the addition to match the exterior of the existing house in its original form. There will be cedar clapboard siding, corner boards, also

extending to columns and brick foundation. Also, the windows and exterior doors to be all wood windows with no cladding.

S. Makowka asked specifically about the existing structure. T. Cain explained that the intent was to restore the existing Parmenter house to its original details. On the rear elevation you can see a sunroom with oval windows where the original siding is exposed. On the rest of the house, the cladding is substitute shingle siding (fiber). Their proposal is to remove that siding and restore the original clapboards when uncovered. Where the proposed addition joins the back of house, some of that will have to be repaired and result on its removal. Will put clapboard on new section smooth side out to match original conditions. S. Makowka advised the applicant to be sure to give more detail on scope of project they are proposing so everyone is on same page. We need as much details as possible. In response to questions about the drawings, T. Cain explained that the water table is there and they didn't remove anything. There is no trim disturbed at all in the plan. S. Makowka said that they should clearly articulate all the proposed changes so we're all on same page. D. Baldwin asked about the door on existing structure in the back – there is a step there now that is not shown in plan. T. Cain responded that that will be kept. T. Cain also clarified that the room shown on the plan with oval windows is existing but that the earlier drawings didn't show that detail. He also said that the substitute siding is on the main body of the house and not on the side structures.

S. Makowka had questions about the proposed additions. One of the features of the Italianate style are strong corner boards. However, the top one on very left stops and the clapboard wraps around corner of house and the protruding bay to right above the pergola doesn't have any corner boards at all – both cases strike him as if an important architectural feature is missing. T. Cain explained that the roof, near the protruding bay, that connects the two portions of the structure actually overshoots and that corner board cannot run through as S. Makowka suggests. He stated that this becomes clear in later plans and elevations how that roof works. B. Cohen said you need the roof to overhang and this is a common wall. Look on sheet A8 and you will see a view that makes it clearer. Perspective views – you see how it is clearer there than on a straight on view. D. Baldwin noted that on the original house on bottom side rear elevation the plans show wider cornerboards than on the left elevation on A3. Also, the plans show different windows – some 2 over 2 and some 1 over 1. T. Cain responded that the existing cornerboards would not be changed and that the proposed windows on the addition windows will match the existing house. He stated that looking at rear elevation, they are 2 over 2 but that the drawings don't show this correctly but they are actually 2 over 2. S. Makowka said on A3, on the lower drawing, the corner board again really looks funny. Architect said that the corner board on the existing house below the chimney actually stops halfway down. M. Penzenik said regardless of what exists around corner or down she feels this is element is weak and there should be a statement that ends that way. T. Cain's response was that the corner boards and trim boards intentionally not same on the top and bottom. They did simplify the plans from earlier versions by removing the balcony at that location and the spaces between the windows are meant to be trim and not clapboard. Idea was to balance between white trim and clapboard. They tried to balance it out.

S. Makowka noted that the massing enclosing stairwell in front by garage has a lower roofline but has the same deep overhang as the main roofline but doesn't appear to have any of the same Italianate corbels or brackets. T. Cain explained that the corbels will wrap around the roof and are not drawn in the plan. C. Barry noted that the heads of windows on the first floor of the right elevation don't index with the siding i.e., they

do not align – why? T. Cain has to think as to why that is and he can get back to us later – it might relate to what's going on in the room. He did indicate that on A8, there are as built windows that don't line up. They're actually different at sill level and at top. They tend to be somewhat random per room. Windows on 2nd floor on either side of palladium don't line up. D. Baldwin asked about window over entryway – does that sill sit over the roof – Answer: yes it's very close to the roof. In response to question about the chimney on the existing house, T. Cain noted that it is located midway on ridge on main body of house – but is simply not shown on the drawings. Also, they will have 1 chimney on the proposed addition. S. Makowka noted that on the upper left hand edge of the drawing at A9 you appear to show the roof edge as being only have 2 or 3 inches high vertically but it is hard to see the finished look -- what is the proposed treatment for that edge. Answer: there will be typical drip edge with kick. S. Makowka asked if the way that element is drawn would that be how a flat roof Italianate eave would have looked? B. Cohen said roof rafters would have come out from house. Roof fabric on top will be a rubber roof.

J. Cummings said it sounds like we're no longer talking about whether we like an addition and it seems like the Commission is moving forward with the additional information we want to see. She feels it is a magnificent addition and can't wait to see it happen.

K. Connelly, a neighbor at 9 Russell St., commented that she walks by this house every morning and loves the property. She does not think the addition takes away from the beauty of the original structure. She only wishes that the addition had a peak roof but that is personal preference and she has tremendous support for this project. Neighbors across the street have living room and bedroom windows that look into the existing garage and are happy that the addition will block their seasonal view of the Dunkin Donuts. They love the idea of the siding coming off the existing structure and are in support. J. Cummings commented that she hopes the applicant uses our comments in the spirit that the HDC can help make your project better.

M. Penzenik said in one drawing it shows that the least well resolved part of it is the connector between the two structures -- it looks awkward to her. B. Cohen said that she likes the awkwardness and it looks like it is connecting two separate buildings. M. Penzenik feels that the scale is too big. The massing is too big. That part of the project is mimicked after the step-down on A7 – the telescoping of the house. She feels it is just awkward. If the roof came down it would free up the corner board problem. It would still remain a pitched roof but would lower the eaves and the ridge line.

C. Hamilton said she still doesn't think we are addressing the number one reason that the Commission is interested in this property – the reason this house is set in that District is the original Parmenter House and its original siting on the lot -- what are we doing to it if we allow his addition? It seems to her that part of the lure of the old houses in a historic district is the open space they have on the lot. S. Makowka said the massing is certainly one of the issues that we consider when we look at any proposed addition. J. Cummings said this is a unique opportunity because it is such a large lot. The architect said he really wants to assure you this is not being done simply because it can – it is being done to enhance the use of the house while preserving its integrity. S. Makowka noted that he appreciates that they are trying to minimize the impact of the addition but that the question of whether this addition is appropriate is still an item for the Commission to consider. J. Worden said he still stands by his words at last meeting that although we're focusing on details, that doesn't mean we

have already bought the whole concept. The fundamental question is should something be put here? If so what? How big? How high? How much subject to public view, etc.?
Hearing continued to 4/17.

c. **Informal Hearing re: 26 Academy Street (Wright) re: new garage - cancelled**

6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtors
- c. April meeting 4/17

7. OPEN FORUM

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)

Project List:

- 1. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 10-13P) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
- 2. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-15P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage Door)
- 3. 193 Westminster (Pemsler - 10-21M) – Cohen – COA (Windows, Siding)
- 4. 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan – 10-32J) – Cohen – COA (Chimney-Skylite)
- 5. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 10-41M) – Cohen – COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
- 6. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 10-49M) – Makowka – COA (Door)
- 7. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-51M) – Cohen – COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
- 8. 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers – 10-53M) – Cohen – COA (Garage)
- 9. 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo – 11-08M) – Penzenik – COA (Addition-Windows)
- 10. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-13M) – Nyberg – COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
- 11. 44 Academy Street (Gevalt/Bachrach -11-21P) – Penzenik – COA (Shed)
- 12. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec – 11-25M) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
- 13. 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green – 11-40J) – Cohen – COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)
- 14. 111 Pleasant Street (Frideau – 11-49) – Nyberg – COA (Fence)
- 15. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 11-50M) – Black – COA (Gutters)
- 16. 30-32 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-08J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Repair)
- 17. 15-15A Avon Place (Burke – 12-10A) – Black/Nyberg – COA (Main House/Garage Demo/Carriage House Build)
- 18. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 12-14P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
- 19. 734 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 12-17J) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
- 20. 214R Pleasant Street (Bisher-Bernstein – 12-22P) Penzenik - COA (House Redesign)
- 21. 66 Pleasant Street (Fraumeni – 12-30P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters/Downspouts)
- 22. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-31A) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles)
- 23. 11 Wellington Street (Herold – 12-36P) – Makowka – CONA (Fence)
- 24. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-37A) – Cohen – COA (Railing)
- 25. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 12-38P) – Makowka – COA (Porches-Entry-Fire Esc)
- 26. 156 Pleasant Street (Seitz – 12-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Windows)
- 27. 47 Irving Street (Kaplan – 12-40J) Cohen – COA (House Addition)
- 28. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Sliding Doors)
- 29. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-49P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
- 30. 119 Pleasant Street (Poulos Trust – 12-53P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
- 31. 30 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-52J) – Nyberg – COA (Porches)

32. 195 Westminster Ave. (Rothstein – 13-01M) – Cohen – COA (Skylights/Tube)
33. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 13-02M) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
34. 55 Westminster Ave. (Maier/Ching – 13-04M) – Cohen – COA (Windows)
35. 21 Central Street (Dyer – 13-05C) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
36. 75 Pleasant Street (Bos. Church of Christ – 13-07P) – Makowka/Cohen – COA (Annex Renovations/Church Restorations)
37. Lot 47 (aka 247 Pleasant Street- 13-08P) – Nyberg – COA (new house)
38. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 13-10P) – Penzenik – COA (Cupola/Windows)
39. 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 13-16P) – Makowka – CONA (chimney repair)
40. 7 Jason Terrace (Fredieu – Historical Society – 13-22J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
41. 15 Wellington Street (Cohen – 13-28P) – Makowka – COA (gutters/fascia/soffits)
42. 208 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-29P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
43. 210 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-30P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
44. 33 Gray Street (Lubar – 13-35J) – Makowka (CONA (stairs and deck)
45. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 13-38M) – Makowka – CONA (siding)
46. 24 Avon Place (Sayigh – 13-41A) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
47. 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines-Pascale – 13-46M) – Barry – COA (garage)
48. 23 Jason Street (Leary-Hammerman – 13-47J) – Cohen – COA (addition)
49. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 13-48M) – Makowka – COA (fence)
50. 15 Oak Knoll (Lo – 13-52P) – Makowka – CONA (windows, doors)
51. 49 Academy Street (Baldwin – 13-53P) – Worden – COA (steps)
52. 31 Central Street (Sampson/Cummings – 13-54C) – Makowka – COA (addition)
53. 211 Pleasant St. (Stark-McElduff – 13-58P) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
54. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-59P) – Barry – COA (repairs)
55. 10 Central Street (Hedlune – 13-60C) – Baldwin – COA (solar panels)
56. 37 Jason Street (Lees – 13-61J) – Makowka – DENIAL (solar panels)
57. 272 Broadway (Danieli/Crispin – 13-62B) – Makowka – COA (dormer)
58. 216 Pleasant St. (Russell – 13-63P – Bush – COA (soffit vent)
59. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-64P) – Cummings – 10 day COA (wall)
60. 24 Central Street (Donnelly/Fisher – 13-65C) – Makowka – CONA (porch/steps)
61. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger/Fleming – 13-66M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
62. 7 Central Street (Sampson – 13-67C) – Makowka – CONA (solar panels)
63. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-68P) – Cummings – COA (stairway/wall/fence/rail)
64. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 13-69P) – Penzenik – COA (windows, doors, deck)
65. 152 Pleasant Street (Niles – 13-70P) – Bush – COA (gutters)
66. 21 Maple Street K(Theosophical Society – 13-71P) – Makowka – CONA (gutters/fascia)
67. 19 Wellington Street (Kirchheimer – 13-72P) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
68. 135 Pleasant St. Unit 9&10 (Atkinson-Bing – 13-73P) – Makowka – COA (a/c condenser and rear porch door)
69. 20 Russell Street (Martin/Briggs – 13-75R) – Makowka – CONA (gutters)
70. 735 Mass. Ave. (Highrock Church – 13-76J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
71. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-77P) – Barry – COA (skylight)
72. 17 Irving Street (Town of Arl-Parmenter – 13-78P) – Makowka – DENIAL – fence
73. 11 Russell Terrace (Boroway – 14-01R) – Makowka – CONA (basement windows/siding)
74. Lot 47 (aka 247) Pleasant Street (Alouette Rlty/Noonan – 14-02P) – COA (New Building)
75. 111 Pleasant St. (Fredieu – 14-03P) – COA (Awnings)
76. 40 Westmoreland Ave. (Radoslovich – 14-04M) – CONA (Rear & deck sliders)
77. 17 Russell St. (Makowka – 14-05R) – 10 Day COA (roof & gutters)
78. 21 Oak Knoll (Donal – 14-06P) – CONA (side door)

Meeting Adjourned 10:09pm.